



WINNING JOBS NARRATIVE PROJECT

IMPLEMENTATION MESSAGE TESTING:

Immigration & the Economy

October 2022



Winning Jobs Narrative

Upcoming Research Briefing

Register at

<https://us06web.zoom.us/meeting/register/tZYrd-Cqqj0pG9Y4iVZxgRQDh0XIRTsOAX92>

Wednesday, Oct. 12 – 11:30AM ET

New Testing: WJN Winning Messages



Winning Jobs Narrative Architecture

5 Key Elements:

- 1** Center and lead with working people—the heroes—so they hear that they are our priority.
- 2** Value and support work to connect around deeply held shared values.
- 3** Situate working people as the engines of our economy—the logic model for our policies.
- 4** Position government in a supporting (not starring) role, so that we respect and center personal agency.
- 5** Relate policy to the broader economy and broad benefits, to remind people that we're focused on the economy and shared prosperity.



Winning Jobs Narrative

Implementation Research Topics (to date)

- Child Tax Credit
- Climate Change and the Economy
- Tools v. Help
- Delivering on the Economy
- CHIPS & Science Act
- Inflation Reduction Act
- Corporations, Competition & Prices
- Student/Education Debt Relief

- Online survey of 7,690 likely voters nationwide, conducted Sept. 27-28, 2022 by Blue Rose Research
- 26 messages (and 4 far-right oppo messages) tested against control group to see movement on two dependent variables:
 - **Generic Congressional Horse Race**
 - **(Agree/Disagree) “Economic policies supported by Democrats would help people like me.”**

Thanks to Bruna Bouhid-Sollod, Cynthia Buiza, Vanessa Michel, Melissa Morales, Caitlin Opperman, Doug Rivlin, Kimberly Serrano, Frank Sharry, and Anita Vukovic for their contributions to this research.



Our Testing Approaches

- **Different takes on message approaches**
- **Variations of phrases/language within messages**
- **All tested messages begin with the same preamble:**
“Economic policies supported by Democrats would help people like me.”



Context to Understand This Message Test

- **The purpose of this test was not to inform messaging for proactive advocacy related to immigrant rights.** Immigrant rights advocates understand best how to frame the immigration debate and have provided excellent guidance in *The Ultimate Messaging Guide to Winning the Immigration Narrative*, available by contacting research@caimmigrant.org. Also worth noting: inquire with your state C3 or C4 table for access to **national immigration voter models**.
- **This test, instead, is intended to focus more squarely on immigration within an electoral context**, and advocates who helped develop *The Ultimate Guide* cooperated with the WJN team. The Extreme Right playbook of stoking anxiety around immigration as a political wedge is not new, and shows no sign of ending. And there is no clear shared strategy among progressives about how best to contend with those attacks.
- **In this test, we explored whether the WJN architecture could be effectively invoked to frame immigration, and perceptions of immigrants.** More work needs to be done, but we believe this test indicates that progressive **leaders can share a positive vision for immigration within a framework that still centers working families and their key priorities - keeping voters top priorities front and center.**



Key Learnings

1. **Immigration** is a complex issue, one that is often used to divide and polarize voters and stoke fears about scarcity. However, **all messages in this test performed either positively or neutrally compared to the placebo.** None provoked backlash overall.
2. **Messages that broadly linked immigration to the health and growth of our economy, working people, and contribution performed best—just as they did in our previous test on student debt relief.** Immigration is at the nexus of economic, culture, and security concerns. Not only is it a false choice to say that people have to choose between Economic or Social Issues, but on many topics that distinction itself is a false construct.
3. **Message performance was largely consistent across demographics. The only notable difference involved age, with messages performing considerably better with younger voters (18-34) compared to older voters (65+).** The latter was the main place where we saw negative movement vis a vis our messages.



Key Learnings (cont'd)

- 4. Immigration messages that included “villain” framing were less effective than those that did not. The only message in the top 10 that included a villain referred to “extreme Republicans.”** The messages that referred to “MAGA Republicans” placed in the bottom half of those tested, and in the 7th and 12th percentiles of messages tested by Blue Rose Research during the current cycle.



Top Tier Messages



Broader Agenda + Contribution

Democrats are doing exactly that with new laws that lower the costs of healthcare, energy, and education for hardworking families and rebuild our supply chains here in America.

They're also working to fix our immigration system. Immigrants contribute to and invest in local communities—and a just, humane (*SPLIT: orderly/functional*) immigration system is an important part of building a healthy and growing economy for us all.

| | Policy | Policy Rural | Policy Non-College | Policy Black | Policy Latino | Policy AAPI | Policy Reliable Dem | Policy New Biden | Policy Swing Voter | Ballot | Ballot Swing | BRR % (Ballot) |
|-------------------------------|--------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|---------------|-------------|---------------------|------------------|--------------------|--------|--------------|----------------|
| Broader Agenda + Contribution | 1.9% | 2.0% | 1.9% | 1.5% | 1.9% | 2.3% | 1.2% | 1.9% | 3.7% | 0.7% | 1.9% | 68% |

We tested four opposition messages. On vote choice, this was among five pro-immigration messages that outperformed the best testing opposition message. Three additional messages tied the best testing opposition message in terms of movement on vote choice.



**Working Families
+ Middle Out
(Dignity/Respect)**

...It's about what's best for working families, because they are our economy. That's why Democrats are lowering costs of healthcare and energy, rebuilding our supply chains, and working to fix our immigration system. People will always move, so we need a humane, orderly, and functional system **that ensures people who do so—including people who don't have current immigration status—are treated with dignity and respect.**

**Working Families
+ Middle Out
(Removing Barriers)**

...It's about what's best for working families, because they are our economy. That's why Democrats are lowering costs of healthcare and energy, rebuilding our supply chains, and working to fix our immigration system. People will always move, so we need a humane, orderly, and functional system **that removes unnecessary barriers for working people—including people who don't have current immigration status—who want to contribute.**

| | Policy | Policy Rural | Policy Non-College | Policy Black | Policy Latino | Policy AAPI | Policy Reliable Dem | Policy New Biden | Policy Swing Voter | Ballot | Ballot Swing | BRR % (Ballot) |
|--------------------------------------|--------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|---------------|-------------|---------------------|------------------|--------------------|--------|--------------|----------------|
| Working Families (Dignity/Respect) | 1.5% | 1.5% | 1.6% | 1.5% | 1.9% | 2.0% | 1.0% | 1.6% | 2.9% | 0.5% | 1.5% | 44% |
| Working Families (Removing Barriers) | 1.4% | 1.5% | 1.5% | 1.2% | 1.6% | 1.8% | 0.9% | 1.4% | 2.7% | 0.5% | 1.4% | 39% |



**Part of Communities
+ Contribution
+ Taxes**

When working families do well, our economy does well. Immigrants are **part of our local communities and economies**. Farmers and small businesses depend on them for important jobs. **Like everyone, immigrants pay taxes—contributing nearly \$500 billion a year in federal and state taxes**. We need an immigration system that is both orderly and functional. That's good for our economy, and good for us all.

| | Policy | Policy Rural | Policy Non-College | Policy Black | Policy Latino | Policy AAPI | Policy Reliable Dem | Policy New Biden | Policy Swing Voter | Ballot | Ballot Swing | BRR % (Ballot) |
|---|--------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|---------------|-------------|---------------------|------------------|--------------------|--------|--------------|----------------|
| Part of Communities + Contribution + Taxes | 1.5% | 1.5% | 1.5% | 1.3% | 1.7% | 1.9% | 1.0% | 1.5% | 2.8% | 0.5% | 1.5% | 43% |



| | |
|--|--|
| <p>Immigration Economy + Thrive + Dems Working + Humane/Just</p> | <p>Immigration is important for a healthy, growing economy. Immigrants help local communities <u>thrive</u>, and farmers and small businesses depend on them for essential jobs. Like everyone, immigrant families pay taxes—contributing \$500 billion a year in federal and state taxes. <u>Democrats are working to create</u> an immigration system that's <u>humane and just</u>. That's good for our economy, and good for all of us.</p> |
| <p>Immigration Economy + Contribute + We Should Agree + Orderly/Functional</p> | <p>Immigration is important for a healthy, growing economy. Immigrants <u>contribute</u> to local communities, and farmers and small businesses depend on them for essential jobs. Like everyone, immigrant families pay taxes—contributing \$500 billion a year in federal and state taxes. <u>We should be able to agree</u> on an immigration system that's <u>orderly and functional</u>. That's good for our economy, and good for all of us.</p> |
| <p>Immigration Economy + Contribute + Dems Working + Orderly/Functional</p> | <p>Immigration is important for a healthy, growing economy. Immigrants <u>contribute</u> to local communities, and farmers and small businesses depend on them for essential jobs. Like everyone, immigrant families pay taxes—contributing \$500 billion a year in federal and state taxes. <u>Democrats are working to create</u> an immigration system that's <u>orderly and functional</u>. That's good for our economy, and good for all of us.</p> |
| <p>Immigration Economy + Thrive + Dems Working + Orderly/Functional</p> | <p>Immigration is important for a healthy, growing economy. Immigrants help local communities <u>thrive</u>, and farmers and small businesses depend on them for essential jobs. Like everyone, immigrant families pay taxes—contributing \$500 billion a year in federal and state taxes. <u>Democrats are working to create</u> an immigration system that's <u>orderly and functional</u>. That's good for our economy, and good for all of us.</p> |



| | Policy | Policy Rural | Policy Non-College | Policy Black | Policy Latino | Policy AAPI | Policy Reliable Dem | Policy New Biden | Policy Swing Voter | Ballot | Ballot Swing | BRR % (Ballot) |
|---|--------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|---------------|-------------|---------------------|------------------|--------------------|--------|--------------|----------------|
| Immigration Economy + Thrive + Dems Working + Humane/Just | 1.2% | 1.2% | 1.1% | 1.0% | 1.3% | 1.4% | 0.7% | 1.1% | 2.1% | 0.4% | 1.1% | 34% |
| Immigration Economy + Contribute + We Should Agree + Orderly/Functional | 1.1% | 1.1% | 1.1% | 1.1% | 1.4% | 1.5% | 0.7% | 1.2% | 2.1% | 0.4% | 1.1% | 33% |
| Immigration Economy + Contribute + Dems Working + Orderly/Functional | 1.1% | 1.0% | 1.0% | 1.0% | 1.5% | 1.5% | 0.5% | 1.0% | 1.8% | 0.3% | 0.9% | 21% |
| Immigration Economy + Thrive + Dems Working + Orderly/Functional | 1.0% | 1.0% | 1.0% | 1.0% | 1.3% | 1.6% | 0.6% | 1.1% | 1.9% | 0.3% | 0.9% | 26% |



Villains



| | |
|--|--|
| <p>Extreme Republican Focus + Invest/Farmers/Small Business</p> | <p>When extreme Republicans bash immigrants, that's about politics and division, not progress for America. <u>Immigrants invest in local communities where they work as farmers and small business owners.</u> Like everyone, immigrant families pay taxes—contributing \$500 billion a year in federal and state taxes. We should put politics aside to fix our immigration system so that it's orderly and functional.</p> |
| <p>MAGA Republican Focus + Invest/Farmers/Small Business + Safe</p> | <p>When MAGA Republicans bash immigrants, that's about politics and division, not progress for America. <u>Immigrants invest in local communities where they work as farmers and small business owners.</u> Like everyone, immigrant families pay taxes—contributing \$500 billion a year in federal and state taxes. We should put politics aside to fix our immigration system so that it's orderly, functional, and safe.</p> |
| <p>MAGA Republican Focus + Invest/Fill Jobs</p> | <p>When MAGA Republicans bash immigrants, that's about politics and division, not progress for America. <u>Immigrants invest in local communities and fill important jobs in farming and small businesses.</u> Like everyone, immigrant families pay taxes—contributing \$500 billion a year in federal and state taxes. We should put politics aside to fix our immigration system so that it's orderly and functional.</p> |
| <p>Immigration Economy + DeSantis Political Stunt</p> | <p>Immigration is part of a healthy, growing economy. But people like Florida's Ron DeSantis are misusing economic recovery funds to put people who fled persecution in communist countries on planes and buses and drop them in other states. These cruel political stunts not only hurt immigrants, but they also take relief funds from small businesses that need them, hurting our economy and all of us.</p> |



| | Policy | Policy Rural | Policy Non-College | Policy Black | Policy Latino | Policy AAPI | Policy Reliable Dem | Policy New Biden | Policy Swing Voter | Ballot | Ballot Swing | BRR % (Ballot) |
|---|--------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|---------------|-------------|---------------------|------------------|--------------------|--------|--------------|----------------|
| Extreme Republican Focus + Invest/Farmers/Small Business | 1.1% | 1.0% | 1.1% | 1.0% | 1.4% | 1.5% | 0.7% | 1.1% | 2.0% | 0.4% | 0.3% | 30% |
| MAGA Republican Focus + Invest/Farmers/Small Business + Safe | 0.7% | 0.7% | 0.7% | 0.7% | 1.0% | 1.1% | 0.4% | 0.8% | 1.3% | 0.4% | 0.2% | 12% |
| MAGA Republican Focus + Invest/Fill Jobs | 0.6% | 0.6% | 0.7% | 0.7% | 1.0% | 0.9% | 0.4% | 0.7% | 1.1% | 0.3% | 0.2% | 7% |
| Immigration Economy + DeSantis Political Stunt | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.6% | 1.3% | 1.1% | 0.3% | 0.7% | 0.9% | 0.3% | 0.2% | 3% |



Tuition Equity



| | |
|--|--|
| <p>Tuition Equity + Unequal System + Taxes Already Supporting</p> | <p>[PRECEDES ALL] Immigration is important for a healthy, growing economy. <u>But our unequal college tuition system shuts out millions of high school graduates every year who don't have current immigration status.</u> Let's ensure equal access to affordable, in-state college tuition <u>for local students whose federal, state, and sales taxes already support our schools.</u> A skilled workforce means a strong economy, and that's good for all of us.</p> |
| <p>Tuition Equity + Business Case</p> | <p>... <u>Businesses rely on educated workers to fill local jobs we desperately need. When every student who graduates high school and meets requirements—including those who call this country home but don't have current immigration status—can pay the same college tuition as other in-state residents, that helps attract and retain businesses and employers. That's good for everyone.</u></p> |
| <p>Tuition Equity + Process to Participate + Skilled Local Workforce</p> | <p>... <u>Students who call this country home but don't have current immigration status need a process to participate and contribute to their local communities and our economy. A skilled local workforce is important,</u> and making sure immigrants have an opportunity to gain higher education for the same tuition as other in-state residents is good for all of us.</p> |
| <p>Tuition Equity + Unequal System + Losing Future Workers</p> | <p>... <u>But our unequal college tuition system is shutting out millions of high school graduates every year who don't have current immigration status. Losing future healthcare workers, first responders, teachers, and entrepreneurs hurts our economy—and all of us.</u> Equal access to affordable, in-state college education ensures a more prosperous future for all.</p> |
| <p>Tuition Equity + Process to Participate</p> | <p>... <u>Students who call this country home but don't have current immigration status need a process to participate in society and contribute to local communities and our economy.</u> An opportunity to gain higher education for the same tuition as other in-state residents helps immigrants take care of their families and contribute to our economy.</p> |
| <p>Tuition Equity + Unequal System + Graduated Our High Schools</p> | <p>... <u>But our unequal college tuition system is shutting out millions of high school graduates every year who don't have current immigration status.</u> We need to create equal access to affordable, in-state college tuition <u>for every student who graduates from our high schools.</u> A skilled workforce means a strong economy, and that's good for all of us.</p> |



| | Policy | Policy Rural | Policy Non-College | Policy Black | Policy Latino | Policy AAPI | Policy Reliable Dem | Policy New Biden | Policy Swing Voter | Ballot | Ballot Swing | BRR % (Ballot) |
|---|--------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|---------------|-------------|---------------------|------------------|--------------------|--------|--------------|----------------|
| Tuition Equity + Unequal System + Taxes Already Supporting | 1.1% | 1.0% | 1.1% | 1.0% | 1.4% | 1.5% | 0.7% | 1.1% | 2.0% | 0.4% | 0.3% | 30% |
| Tuition Equity + Business Case | 0.7% | 0.7% | 0.7% | 0.7% | 1.0% | 1.1% | 0.4% | 0.8% | 1.3% | 0.4% | 0.2% | 12% |
| Tuition Equity + Process to Participate + Skilled Local Workforce | 0.6% | 0.6% | 0.7% | 0.7% | 1.0% | 0.9% | 0.4% | 0.7% | 1.1% | 0.3% | 0.2% | 7% |
| Tuition Equity + Unequal System + Losing Future Workers | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.6% | 1.3% | 1.1% | 0.3% | 0.7% | 0.9% | 0.3% | 0.2% | 3% |
| Tuition Equity + Process to Participate | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.6% | 1.3% | 1.1% | 0.3% | 0.7% | 0.9% | 0.3% | 0.2% | 3% |
| Tuition Equity + Unequal System + Graduated Our High Schools | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.6% | 1.3% | 1.1% | 0.3% | 0.7% | 0.9% | 0.3% | 0.2% | 3% |

For additional resources on talking about tuition equity from a recent campaign in Arizona, please contact the American Business Immigration Coalition at rovika@americanbic.biz



DACA

**DACA**

Immigration is part of a healthy, growing economy. DACA gives work authorization to young immigrants who have spent most of their lives here, and it protects them from deportation. They're among millions of essential workers who got us through the pandemic, like healthcare and service workers. Removing needless barriers to citizenship for these young immigrants is good for our economy—and for all of us.

| | Policy | Policy Rural | Policy Non-College | Policy Black | Policy Latino | Policy AAPI | Policy Reliable Dem | Policy New Biden | Policy Swing Voter | Ballot | Ballot Swing | BRR % (Ballot) |
|-------------|-------------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|---------------|-------------|---------------------|------------------|--------------------|-------------|--------------|----------------|
| DACA | 0.8% | 0.8% | 0.8% | 0.8% | 1.0% | 1.0% | 0.6% | 0.9% | 1.5% | 0.3% | 0.8% | 15% |

For additional resources on talking about DACA and recent court decisions, please contact United We Dream at homeishere@unitedwedream.org



Driver's Licenses



| | |
|--|---|
| Driver's Licenses + System + Remove Barriers | <p>Immigration is important for a healthy, growing economy. For people already here without current immigration status, we need a system for them to participate in local communities and contribute to our economy. Driver's licenses are tools that immigrants need to work, and they're a way for communities to know and serve their residents. <u>Let's remove needless barriers to a more prosperous economic future for all.</u></p> |
| Driver's Licenses + System + Good for Economy | <p>Immigration is important for a healthy, growing economy. For people already here without current immigration status, we need a system for them to participate in local communities and contribute to our economy. Driver's licenses are tools that immigrants need to work, and they're a way for communities to know and serve their residents. <u>That's good for our economy, and for us all.</u></p> |
| Driver's Licenses + Essential To Safety | <p>Immigration is important for a healthy, growing economy. <u>No matter our immigration status or where we come from, a driver's license is an essential tool to get to work and participate in the local community. We're all safer when we're all driving with a license and able to get where we need to go. That makes good economic sense, and it's good for everyone.</u></p> |



| | Policy | Policy Rural | Policy Non-College | Policy Black | Policy Latino | Policy AAPI | Policy Reliable Dem | Policy New Biden | Policy Swing Voter | Ballot | Ballot Swing | BRR % (Ballot) |
|---|--------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|---------------|-------------|---------------------|------------------|--------------------|--------|--------------|----------------|
| Driver's Licenses + System + Remove Barriers | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.6% | 1.1% | 1.1% | 0.1% | 0.6% | 0.7% | 0.4% | 0.1% | 2% |
| Driver's Licenses + System + Good for Economy | 0.4% | 0.4% | 0.4% | 0.5% | 0.9% | 0.8% | 0% | 0.4% | 0.6% | 0.4% | 0.1% | 1% |
| Driver's Licenses + Essential To Safety | 0.1% | 0.2% | 0.1% | 0.2% | 0.6% | 0.4% | -0.5% | -0.1% | 0% | 0.3% | 0% | 0% |



Border



Border Conditions + MAGA

Immigration is part of a healthy, growing economy. But **conditions at the border** and long wait times make it difficult for hardworking families to come to this country. We've been working toward a solution for years – while MAGA Republicans keep focusing on politics and division. **It's time to put differences aside and create a system that works for us, not against us.**

Invest/Farmers/Small Business + Safe/Orderly Border

Immigration is part of a healthy, growing economy. Immigrants invest in local communities where they work as farmers and small business owners. We need to **fix conditions at the border** and reduce wait times to make it easier for hardworking families to come to this country. **A safe, orderly border makes good economic sense, and is good for us all.**

| | Policy | Policy Rural | Policy Non-College | Policy Black | Policy Latino | Policy AAPI | Policy Reliable Dem | Policy New Biden | Policy Swing Voter | Ballot | Ballot Swing | BRR % (Ballot) |
|---|--------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|---------------|-------------|---------------------|------------------|--------------------|--------|--------------|----------------|
| Border Conditions + MAGA | 0.7% | 0.7% | 0.7% | 0.6% | 1.0% | 0.8% | 1.0% | 0.2% | 1.1% | 0.2% | 0.6% | 11% |
| Invest/Farmers/Small Business + Safe/Orderly Border | 0.6% | 0.6% | 0.6% | 0.6% | 0.8% | 0.7% | 0.9% | 0.3% | 1.0% | 0.2% | 0.5% | 6% |



Framing Keys

- 1) **Connect immigration within a broader agenda** focused on making sure working families have the tools and opportunities to build a good life—including key legislative accomplishments like lowering healthcare and energy costs, and rebuilding supply chains.
- 2) **With policies like student debt relief or policies relating to immigration status, it is important to make clear that the entire economy, and the population overall, benefits.** Short statements, like “immigration is part of a healthy, growing economy” help with making this connection.
- 3) **Focus on asset based framing when referencing immigrant families,** including all the ways they contribute to the economy and country. This challenges right-wing narratives without having to acknowledge them and mitigates zero-sum anxieties.
- 4) **Acknowledge that the immigration system is not functioning well** and needs to be fixed for the sake of immigrant families and the country as a whole.
- 5) **Alluding to bipartisanship may help reduce anxieties, whereas politicizing immigration may elevate those anxieties.**



WINNING JOBS NARRATIVE PROJECT

For additional information, please contact:

Alvina Vasquez

PowerMap Public Affairs

Email: connect@WinningJobsNarrative.org